Changes in male suicides in Scottish prisons: 10-year study

Sheila M. Bird

Background
In 1999 I estimated the expected number of UK prison suicides, taking into account that opioid users’ deaths from suicide were 10 times the number expected for their age and gender. Changes have since taken place in Scottish prisons.

Aims
To estimate the expected number of male suicides in Scottish prisons in 1994–2003, having taken age and opioid dependency into account; and to consider the extremes of prisoner age.

Method
The effective number that prisons safeguard in terms of suicide risk was approximated as 10 times the number of opioid-dependent inmates plus other inmates. By applying age-appropriate suicide rates for Scottish males to these effective numbers, expectations for male suicides in Scottish prisons were calculated.

Results
In 1994–98, there were at least 57 male suicides, significantly exceeding the age- and opioid-adjusted expectation of 41. In 1999–2003, the 51 male suicides in prison were consistent with expectation (upper 95% limit: at least 54). During the decade 1994–2003, observed and expected suicides were mismatched at both extremes of age: 40 males aged 15–24 years died by suicide v. 24 expected, and 13 males aged 45+ v. 2 expected. Against 4.5 prison suicides expected for males aged 15–24 years during a 2-year period, actual suicides were 3 in 2002 + 2003 and 4 in 2004 + 2005.

Conclusions
Scotland has redressed an excess of male suicides, especially by its youngest prisoners.

Declaration of interest
None. Funding from Medical Research Council WBS no. U.1052.00.002.00001.01.

Method
I made two methodological improvements on my previous work.2 First, I introduced separate age distributions for prisoners with and without opioid dependency. Second, for specific age groups (15–24, 25–34, 35–44, 45–54, 55–64, 65–74 years), I applied the...
more robust average death rate from self-harm (per 100,000 males in the general population) for the quinquennium of interest, as supplied by the Registrar General’s Office for Scotland.

The Seventh Prison Survey, in 2004 (overall response rate: 77%), was the sole contemporary source of information on Scottish prisoners’ opioid dependency in 1999–2003. It asked about respondents’ use of specific drugs in the 12 months before incarceration. I requested ad hoc cross-tabulations from the Seventh Prison Survey, which gave the age distribution in 2004 of male respondents according to their reported use (or not) of heroin/other opiates/methadone in the 12 months before incarceration. The data are shown as the final column of online Table DS1. Because only 60% of eligible prisoners responded to questions about specific drug use, the final column of online Table DS2 allows for the possibility of under-reporting, whereby 90% only of those who were opioid dependent had reported this in Table DS1. A third option was to assume that opioid dependency by age group for prisoners in 1999–2003 followed the same pattern as in 1994–98.

From 1992–96 willing Anonymous Salivary HIV (WASH) surveillance studies21,24 in Scottish Prison Service establishments, I deduced an approximate age distribution for adult male injectors in 1994–98 (Table DS1, col. 4), which was assumed to apply for opioid dependency. In Table DS2, opioid dependency was taken to be 1.5 times the corresponding injector prevalence, and therefore 27% among male young offenders and overall 50% for male adult prisoners – a multiplier which aligned well with results from random mandatory drugs testing of Scottish prisoners.25 (And likewise in England and Wales in 2001: of 2266 surveyed prisoners, 29% reported using heroin and 18% reported injecting it in the month before incarceration).22 Proportionate redistribution of injectors from the original WASH age groups to Registrar General’s Office for Scotland age groups had to be carried out, as shown in Table DS1.

According to Scottish Prison Service Annual Reports (follow link from Library to Keydocs at www.sps.gov.uk), the average numbers of male prisoners held by the Scottish Prison Service in the financial years 1999/2000 to 2003/04 were 5764, 5767, 5929, 6193, 6306 (mean for males=5974). In Table DS2, the age distribution for male prisoners in custody on 30 June 2001 (as given in Prison Statistics Scotland, 2001)27 was applied to the quinquennial mean prison population of 5974 male inmates. The corresponding analysis for 1994–98 had to adopt the age distribution for male prisoners in custody on 30 June 1997 (because age distribution was not available for 30 June 1996). The average numbers of prisoners held by the Scottish Prison Service in the financial years 1995/96 to 1998/99 (not available for 1994/95) were 5632, 5992, 6059, 6029 and so the mean for both genders was 5928. Gender breakdown was not available but, at 30 June 1997, 5936/6121 inmates were male, and so the 1994–98 mean male prison population was taken as 5936/6121×5928=5749 male inmates. Having approximated, for each age group, its average number of opioid-dependent and other (that is: non-opioid dependent) male prisoners by quinquennium, the former were given a weight of 10, as in my previous study,2 when computing the expected quinquennial number of male suicides in prison (Table 1).

The Scottish Prison Service maintains separate databases on fatal accident inquiries into prisoner deaths and on prisoner suicides. There is a small risk that suicides in prison in 2004/2005 are undercounted owing to late-reporting fatal accident inquiries. However, since the majority of suicides in prison are by hanging, they are starkly evident.

### Results

In 1994–98, the Scottish Prison Service recorded 100 male deaths in legal custody, for eight of whom cause of death was not detailed on its databases: six deaths at ages 23, 39, 51, 43 (remand), 20 and 34 years in 1994; one death at 53 years in 1995; one death in hospital from ‘natural causes’ at 30 years in 1998. Fifty-seven deaths were known suicides (33 on remand; and 12, 8, 12, 13 and 12 by calendar year; Tables 1 and 2). Three of the 100 deaths in 1994–98 were of prisoners aged 65 years or older.

In 1999–2003, the Scottish Prison Service recorded 92 male deaths in legal custody. Table 2 shows that 51 were suicides (33 on remand; and 13, 14, 9, 9, and 6 by calendar year). Ten of the

### Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age group, years</th>
<th>1994–98: mean number of male prisoners=5748</th>
<th>1999–2003: mean number of male prisoners=5974</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Suicide rate per 100 000 general male population</td>
<td>Expected suicides for male inmates (WASH weighted.prisoner numbers)</td>
<td>Suicide rate per 100 000 general male population</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15–24</td>
<td>19.8</td>
<td>11,425</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25–34</td>
<td>34.3</td>
<td>14,158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35–44</td>
<td>28.4</td>
<td>38,06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45–54</td>
<td>22.5</td>
<td>359</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55–64</td>
<td>15.5</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65–74</td>
<td>14.9</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>29,553</td>
<td>41.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| a. In 1994–98, eight deaths were described as 'formal findings only' (six in 1994, one in 1995) or from 'natural causes' (one in 1998).
| b. Calculated using age distributions for opioid-dependent adult male prisoners, as derived from age distribution for adult injecting in 1992–96 willing Anonymous Salivary HIV (WASH) surveillance studies see online Table DS1 for further details.
| c. Calculated using age distributions for opioid-dependent adult male prisoners, as derived from age distribution for adult injecting in Seventh Prison Survey, 2004 (see Table DS1 for further details).
| d. Calculated using opioid dependency (or not) by age group applied to 1999–2003 if only 90% of dependency was reported in Seventh Prison Survey 2004 (see Table DS2 for further details).
92 deaths in 1999–2003 occurred in prisoners aged 65 years or older. Table 1 gives, by age group, Scotland's average death rates from self-inflicted harm per 100 000 males for 1994–98 and 1999–2003. Male suicide rates were highest at 25–34 years and 35–44 years of age.

To take opioid-dependent prisoners' 10 times greater suicide risk1 into account, in Table 1, I have multiplied by \( X = \) (number of opioid-dependent male prisoners) \( \times 10 \) number of non-opioid-dependent male prisoners, Scotland's age-specific suicide rates per 100 000 males to work out, for each age group, the expected numbers of male suicides in Scottish prisons in 1999–2003 and in 1994–98. For 1994–98, Table 1 shows an estimated 268 (27%) out of 268+725=993 young offenders as opioid dependent, but 770 out of 1090 inmates aged 21–24 years. Taking their opioid dependency into account, these 2083 male prisoners aged 15–24 years had a weighted suicide risk equivalent to 11 425 males of the same age in the Scottish population.

Table 1 shows summarily that, whereas 57 male suicides (at least) in 1994–98 significantly exceeded the age- and opioid-adjusted expectation of 41.1 for 1994–1998 (upper 95% limit 54), the 51 male suicides in 1999–2003 were in line with the expectation of 41 to 45 (upper 95% limit at least 54).

Even having made allowance for opioid dependency, the actual age distribution of known suicides was at odds with the age distribution expected for suicides in 1994–2003. The total number of suicides by 15– 24-year-old male prisoners was nearly twice the expected number (21+19=40 v. 11.3+12.5=23.8). Also, at the other extreme of prisoner age, there were 13 known suicides by male prisoners aged 45+ years v. 2 expected.

Eighty per cent of suicides by male prisoners aged 15–24 years in Scotland for the decade 1994–2003 were among young men on remand or who were untried ((17+15)/(21+19) = 32/40; 95% CI 68–92%). Those on remand or untried accounted for around half only of the self-inflicted deaths by prisoners aged 25–34 years with known remand/convicted status (20/39; 95% CI 35–67%), or by older men (14/28; 95% CI 31–69%).

## Discussion

Other factors besides age and opioid dependency clearly matter for the mitigation of male suicides in prison. They include mental health comorbidity, remand status, time since reception and the seriousness or violence of the prisoner's indictment offence. None of these other factors is adequately addressed by an analysis which adjusts solely for age and opioid dependency. However, going further would require ethically approved access to prisoner information systems which hold medical or 'prisoner-in-confidence' data.

Male prisoners' suicides significantly exceeded age- and opioid-dependency adjusted expected suicides in 1994–98 (at least 57 observed v. 41 expected) but exceeded the annual alert threshold of 12 only once.20,28 Suicides by male prisoners were consistent with expectation in 1999–2003 (51 observed v. 41–45 expected), despite worryingly high numbers2 of 13+14 in 1999+2000.

In the decade 1994–2003, there were nearly twice as many suicides by 15- to 24-year-old male prisoners (40) as expected (24) after accounting for opioid dependency. Also, at the other extreme of prisoner age, there were 13 known suicides at age 45+ years v. 2 expected.

Mismatch of the age distributions of observed v. opioid-adjusted expected suicides emphasised the vulnerability of male prisoners aged 15–24 years: 80% of suicides in this age group were by young men on remand or who were untried. Their vulnerability was addressed by the Scottish Prison Service's changes in how addictions and the identifying of suicide risk15 are dealt with on reception into prison, and by remediating deficiencies in younger prisoners' induction and their lack of activities or occupation on remand.16,18

UK's prison inspectors were influential in tackling prison suicides,10,13,16–19 Mental health nurses now conduct the suicide risk assessment on reception into prison, and the number of them in post featured regularly in Scotland's prison inspection reports in 1994–2003. In-cell television to reduce suicides by remand prisoners was first suggested in the 1995–96 report by Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Prisons for Scotland13 and again in Women Offenders – A Safer Way.16 Initially, the suggestion received a stony ministerial hearing until in-cell electricity facilitated in-cell television from 2000.

**Punishment First, Verdict Later**17 reviewed conditions for remand prisoners in Scotland at the end of the 20th century; it highlighted induction deficiencies and poor prisoner–staff relationships, which require an understanding of the particular pressures and problems encountered by remand prisoners so that their needs might be better met and rights safeguarded. ‘Because of the numbers’ was staff’s explanation of why so many remand prisoners had so little time out of their cells, so few programmes were available to them, why there was limited access to telephones, showers and possessions, and why they were sometimes housed with convicted prisoners. In Scotland no operating standards dealt specifically with remand prisoners, whose legal status should have entitled them, in the inspectorate’s view, to a continuance of (community-) prescribed medication14 and equitable delivery of other services. Dependency on others, even for access to money during their period of remand, ‘compounded feelings of helplessness and hopelessness, with sometimes tragic consequences’.

Healthcare standards introduced in May 1998 required Scottish prisons to provide detoxification regimes, but not until Health Care Standard 10 in 2001 was continuation, or provision in prison, of substitution therapy14 given equal prominence. The proportion of (around 7000) prisoners testing positive for methadone in random mandatory drugs tests increased from 1% in the financial year 2002/03 to 9% in 2003/04 and 14% in

---

**Table 2**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Prisoner on remand/untired</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Prisoner on remand/untired</td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15–24</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25–34</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35–44</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45+</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total for all ages</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Status undetermined for one prisoner, eight known to be convicted.
2004/05,20 as the Scottish Prison Service’s new methadone policy took hold.

Against the progressive backdrop of the Scottish Prison Service’s revised suicide risk and drugs strategies, mental health nurses at reception assessments, in-cell television and improved induction for remand prisoners, male suicides by 15- to 24-year-olds were 3+0 in 2002+2003 and 2+2 in 2004+2005, against a 2-year expectation of 4.5. The exceptional vulnerability to suicide of the youngest age group of prisoners may thus have been reduced.

International prison comparators, or intervention studies, would be needed to decipher how much credit to ascribe to the different components of the Scottish Prison Service’s successful approach for its youngest prisoners, or to assess their relative cost-effectiveness.

The Scottish Prison Service’s attention should now turn to its older male prisoners7 (aged 45+ years), whose excess suicides have different precursors; there were six such suicides in around 2400 prisoner-years during 2002 to 2005.

Graham Jackson, Registrar General’s Office for Scotland, for average death rates (per 100 000 males by age group) by cause (intentional self-harm or ischaemic heart disease) in 1994–1998 and 1999–2003; Dr Roisin Ash, Dr James Carnie and Dr Ed Wozniak, Seventh Scottish Prison Service Analytical Services.


Bird SM, Rodly M on behalf of the late Dr. A. Graham Bird and European Taskforce on counting blood-borne viruses and injector-inmates’ behavioural risks – results from European prisons. Howard J Crim Justice 2002; 41; 123–36.


Sheila M. Bird, MA, PhD, CStat, FFPH, Department of Statistics and Modelling Science, University of Strathclyde, and Medical Research Council, Biostatistics Unit, Cambridge CB2 2SR, UK. Email: sheila.bird@flmrc-bsu.cam.ac.uk

First received 3 Apr 2007, final revision 31 Jan 2008, accepted 2 Feb 2008.

Acknowledgements

References


20 Royal College of Psychiatrists. Suicide in Prisons (Council report CR99), Royal College of Psychiatrists, 2002.

21 McIntosh K. Prison officers had no sign of Shipman’s suicidal tendencies. BMJ 2005; 331: 474.


24 Bird SM, Rodly M on behalf of the late Dr. A. Graham Bird and European Taskforce on counting blood-borne viruses and injector-inmates’ behavioural risks – results from European prisons. Howard J Crim Justice 2002; 41; 123–36.


## Data supplement

### Table DS1 Age distributions for opioid-dependent adult male prisoners, as derived from age distribution for adult injectors in 1992–96 Willing Anonymous Salivary HIV (WASH) surveillance studies23,24 or from 2004 Seventh Prison Survey22

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WASH age group, years</th>
<th>Adult male injectors (as per 1994–98, and applied also to 1999–03), n</th>
<th>RGOS age group, years</th>
<th>Adult male injectors, proportionately revised from WASH to RGOS age groups, n</th>
<th>7th Prison Survey</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>21–25</td>
<td>263</td>
<td>21–24</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>15–24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26–30</td>
<td>229</td>
<td>25–29</td>
<td>183+53=236</td>
<td>25–29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31–35</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>30–34</td>
<td>90+46=136</td>
<td>30–34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36+</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>35–44</td>
<td>44+22=66</td>
<td>35–39</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Adult male injectors** 648

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RGOS, Registrar General Office Scotland.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Only 60% of eligible prisoners responded to questions about heroin/other opiates/methadone use.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table DS2 Opioid dependency by age group applied to 1999–2003 mean male prison population of 5974 inmates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age group, years</th>
<th>Male inmates mean</th>
<th>Male inmates</th>
<th>7th Prison Survey</th>
<th>Proportionate redistribution from WASH age groups</th>
<th>If only 90% of opioid dependency reported 7th Prison Survey</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Opioid dependent mean</td>
<td>Non-opioid dependent, mean</td>
<td>Opioid dependent mean</td>
<td>Non-opioid dependent, mean</td>
<td>Opioid dependent mean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Under 21</td>
<td>843</td>
<td>780</td>
<td>1161</td>
<td>228</td>
<td>615</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21–24</td>
<td>1098</td>
<td>674</td>
<td>543</td>
<td>934</td>
<td>282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25–29</td>
<td>1217</td>
<td>566</td>
<td>495</td>
<td>539</td>
<td>522</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30–34</td>
<td>1061</td>
<td>316</td>
<td>391</td>
<td>261</td>
<td>888</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35–39</td>
<td>707</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>320</td>
<td>386</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40–44</td>
<td>442</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45–54</td>
<td>386</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55–64</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65+</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>5974</td>
<td>2533</td>
<td>3441</td>
<td>2566</td>
<td>2564</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**WASH, 1992–96 Willing Anonymous Salivary HIV surveillance studies23,24**
Changes in male suicides in Scottish prisons: 10-year study
Sheila M. Bird
BJP 2008, 192:446-449.
Access the most recent version at DOI: 10.1192/bjp.bp.107.038679

Supplementary Material
Supplementary material can be found at:
http://bjp.rcpsych.org/content/suppl/2008/06/03/192.6.446.DC1

References
This article cites 14 articles, 6 of which you can access for free at:
http://bjp.rcpsych.org/content/192/6/446#BIBL

Reprints/permissions
To obtain reprints or permission to reproduce material from this paper, please write to permissions@rcpsych.ac.uk

You can respond to this article at
/letters/submit/bjprcpsych;192/6/446

Downloaded from
http://bjp.rcpsych.org/ on April 20, 2017
Published by The Royal College of Psychiatrists

To subscribe to The British Journal of Psychiatry go to:
http://bjp.rcpsych.org/site/subscriptions/