Resting vagal activity in schizophrenia: meta-analysis of heart rate variability as a potential endophenotype

Annika Clamor, Tania M. Lincoln, Julian F. Thayer and Julian Koenig

Background
Cardiac vagal tone, indexed by heart rate variability (HRV), is a proxy for the functional integrity of feedback mechanisms integrating central and peripheral physiology.

Aims
To quantify differences in HRV in individuals with schizophrenia compared with healthy controls.

Method
Databases were systematically searched for studies eligible for inclusion. Random effect meta-analyses of standardised mean differences were calculated for vagal activity indicated by high-frequency HRV and the root mean square of successive R–R interval differences (RMSSD).

Results
Thirty-four studies were included. Significant main effects were found for high-frequency HRV ($P = 0.0008$; Hedges’ $g = -0.98$, 95% CI $-1.56$ to $-0.41$, $k = 29$) and RMSSD ($P < 0.0001$; $g = -0.91$, 95% CI $-1.19$ to $-0.62$, $k = 24$), indicating lower vagal activity in individuals with schizophrenia than in healthy controls. Considerable heterogeneity was evident but effects were robust in subsequent sensitivity analyses.

Conclusions
Given the association between low HRV, threat processing, emotion regulation and executive functioning, reduced vagal tone may be an endophenotype for the development of psychotic symptoms.

Declaration of interest
None.

Copyright and usage
© The Royal College of Psychiatrists 2016.
difficulties in executive functioning, emotion regulation and disinhibition that link it to the development and maintenance of psychotic symptoms. This endophenotype could serve as an important target in both the prevention and treatment of schizophrenia and provide a valuable biomarker for research.

Studies have shown that vagal activity during rest is significantly decreased in unmedicated patients with acute schizophrenia compared with healthy control groups.\(^{18,19}\) There is also evidence that although individuals with schizophrenia show a similar adaptation to a stressor, they exhibit lower HRV in the following recovery period compared with a control group.\(^{16}\) As anticholinergic effects are reported for antipsychotic drugs, effects of medication on HRV in schizophrenia have been specifically addressed. It was shown that medicated patients with schizophrenia show lower vagal activity than healthy individuals,\(^{16,20}\) and that some types of medication may cause more deterioration than others.\(^{21}\) However, follow-up assessments from an unmedicated to a medicated status imply that decreased vagal activity in schizophrenia deserves consideration beyond simple effects of medication intake.\(^{18}\) Most interestingly, patterns of HRV alteration similar to those found in schizophrenia are reported in healthy first-degree relatives.\(^{17,19}\) and also in people with prodromal symptoms,\(^{22}\) which lends support to the notion of a potential endophenotype. Nevertheless, several other participant characteristics have been discussed to moderate autonomic nervous system alterations. Generally, HRV has been found to decrease with age;\(^{23}\) furthermore, previous schizophrenia research has indicated a possible association of decreased HRV with increased symptom severity,\(^{20,24}\) and with the duration of disease.\(^{25}\) Hence, the heterogeneity of investigated indices, of participants and of results,\(^{26}\) question the robustness and the size of the effect. We therefore aimed to summarise the current evidence concerning HRV differences in individuals with schizophrenia compared with healthy control groups. In particular, given the aforementioned importance of vagal activity, we focused on quantifying time and frequency domain HRV indices reflecting parasympathetic influences. Time and frequency domain measures were considered, as these are most frequently applied and most likely to be reported consistently across primary studies. Furthermore, possible covariates were subjected to meta-regressions and subgroup analyses to explore clinical and methodological heterogeneity. To our knowledge, this is the first attempt to condense the existing research on HRV and schizophrenia.

**Method**

In August and September 2014 we conducted a systematic literature search in accordance with the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) statement,\(^{27}\) in seven computerised databases (PubMed, Medline, PSYNDEx, Embase, PsycINFO, Web of Science and CINAHL). The search terms were (‘heart rate variability’ OR ‘HRV’) AND (‘schizophrenia’ OR ‘psychosis’) and were limited to the abstract if possible. Additionally, the reference lists of all screened full-text papers were searched for further references of interest (related terms in titles, e.g. ‘variability’, ‘autonomic’, ‘schizophrenia’ and ‘psychosis’). After removing duplicate findings, the abstracts of all studies were screened based on pre-defined criteria. To be included, a study had to be (a) a peer-reviewed, empirical investigation, (b) written in English or German, (c) reporting HRV, (d) conducted on participants with schizophrenia or another psychotic disorders, and (e) on a healthy control group.

**Data extraction and quality assessment**

The following data were extracted from the included studies and coded: year of publication, language, country of research origin and main study focus. Information on study samples was obtained regarding the total sample size, size of included groups, age, gender distribution, the diagnostic criteria and sample nature and recruitment of the schizophrenia and control groups. Finally, we coded details of the HRV recording providing information on the technique of assessment (e.g. electrocardiogram, ECG), sample rate, condition at recording (e.g. supine), recording length of interest, derived HRV indices and reported units.

Measures of HRV reflecting vagal activity were selected based on the guidelines of the Task Force of the European Society of Cardiology and the North American Society of Pacing and Electrophysiology.\(^{3}\) For this meta-analysis we included components that have been considered to reflect primarily vagal cardiac modulation only, as these are more readily interpretable and because vagal activity seems to have a unique role in patients with schizophrenia.\(^{18}\) Thus, studies that reported (or authors who provided) RMSSD or any spectral measure in the high-frequency range of 0.15–0.40 Hz were included. If more than one unit of high frequency was reported, we analysed the standardised values (i.e. normalised, in percentages). Means and standard deviations of these measures were extracted, or requested when insufficient quantitative data were available. When only the standard error of the mean (SEM) was reported, the standard deviation was calculated by multiplying the SEM by the square root of the sample size.\(^{28}\) If the given means were estimates of covariance analyses, the corresponding authors were asked to provide raw means. If 24 h long-term measurements were available, these were included. Otherwise, recordings obtained from resting or baseline conditions were extracted. When only day or night values were available, the night values were analysed as they are more likely to reflect vagal activity owing to less movement and other disturbing influences. Furthermore, authors with potential access to data of interest (i.e. reporting measurement of HRV in schizophrenia and control groups but no data on group analyses; reporting non-linear results or measures of the QT interval only) were contacted.

In several studies the schizophrenia group was stratified into different subgroups (e.g. according to type of medication). If one of these subgroups was an unmedicated group it was selected for data extraction in order to analyse the effects of schizophrenia itself rather than effects related to medication intake. In other cases, data for the total group were requested from the authors. If these values were not available from the authors we combined the groups according to the Cochrane Handbook.\(^{29}\) All data extraction was performed and checked by A.C. and supervised by J.K. If data or methods were ambiguous the content was discussed until A.C. and J.K. reached consensus.

**Statistical analysis**

**Effect size estimation**

To estimate the true effect size across the different studies with variance in reported units, standardised mean differences (SMD; Hedges’ g) with 95% confidence intervals were calculated. The random effects model was applied. In four cases, no data were retrieved on standard deviations; however, range, interquartile range or post-hoc t-test values were available. According to the Cochrane guidelines, standard deviations may be estimated from these.\(^{28}\) However, as this is not strongly recommended and because HRV data are potentially skewed, additional secondary analyses were conducted excluding studies with estimated values. Statistical heterogeneity was tested with the standard I^2 index, \(\chi^2\)-tests and \(t^2\)-tests.\(^{29}\) A possible reporting or publication bias was examined using a funnel plot, depicting the effect size against the standard error for asymmetry. All meta-analytic computations...
were performed with the RevMan software version 5.3.4 (Cochrane Collaboration).

Meta-regression and subgroup analyses
To explore the potential effect of trial-level modifiers, we considered several covariates in meta-regression approaches, conducted with a single covariate at a time. Meta-regression allows the investigation of the effect of continuous and categorical characteristics. We applied the random effects model which acknowledges that some of the heterogeneity of the effects might not be modelled by the covariates. Because some of the defined variables of interest were associated with a small number of studies, subgroup analyses were conducted if fewer than ten studies were available for a category. Meta-regressions and subgroup analyses were conducted using OpenMetaAnalyst software. To account for clinical heterogeneity, four population-level covariates were defined for the schizophrenia patient groups: mean age, mean duration of disease, medication (dichotomously coded as medicated vs. unmedicated) and clinical category of recruited sample (e.g., out-patients). No direct measure of symptom severity could be included because methods of assessment varied greatly. Instead, the patient samples were categorised by best fit into the clinical categories ‘in-patients/ hospitalised’ or ‘out-patients’ and ‘first episode in-patients/ hospitalised’ or ‘chronic’. To account for methodological heterogeneity, three covariates regarding the HRV outcomes; for 10 studies only high-frequency

Results
Initially 505 studies were retrieved from the selected databases (Fig. 1). In addition, 34 studies were identified by searching the reference lists of all subsequently included full-text articles. After removal of duplicates 262 abstracts were systematically screened for inclusion based on the pre-defined criteria, leaving 56 papers potentially eligible for inclusion. Two requests for full-text papers were not answered, and data were extracted from the remaining 54 full-text papers. Of these, 31 studies reported insufficient values (e.g., range instead of standard deviations, means and standard deviations in figures only) and the corresponding authors were contacted to request total or partial data. Finally, the studies were subjected to meta-analysis if effect sizes could be calculated or estimated from the available data ($k = 34$). For 19 of the included studies both high-frequency HRV and RMSSD were available as outcomes; for 10 studies only high-frequency data were available, and for 5 studies only RMSSD data were available. The meta-analysis revealed a significant effect ($Z = 3.35, P = 0.0008$), indicating that individuals with schizophrenia ($n = 1353$) have lower high-frequency HRV compared with non-schizophrenia sample for recruitment, 3 studies reported data on chronic schizophrenia (9%), 17 on in-patients (50%, including 2 studies specifically on in-patients with first-episode disorder) and 5 on out-patients (15%). Twenty-nine of the included studies used ECG (85%) and 3 used photoplethysmography (9%) to measure HRV. In 28 studies (82%) assessment was short-term whereas in 4 (12%) assessment was considered as long-term (i.e. more than 1 h). Of the 29 studies with information on high-frequency HRV, 6 studies provided the data as normalised power (62%). Detailed study characteristics on HRV assessment and reporting length – short (≤ 1 h) or long (> 1 h), method of assessment (ECG or photoplethysmography) and the unit of reported high-frequency values (i.e. absolute power or normalised in proportion to total frequency).

Study and sample characteristics
We included data from 3055 participants for meta-analysis of high-frequency HRV and from 2485 participants for meta-analysis of RMSSD. Detailed characteristics of the included studies and their samples can be found in online Table DS1. The averaged mean age of participants with schizophrenia was 36.8 years, with a range of means from 21.2 years to 56.2 years. In studies that reported a mean duration of illness ($k = 19$) the overall mean duration was 9.9 years (range 3–22.7). Fifteen studies were conducted in participants not receiving medication (44%) and the other 19 (56%) in individuals medicated with varying types of antipsychotics. Of the studies that defined a specific schizophrenia sample for recruitment, 3 studies reported data on chronic schizophrenia (9%), 17 on in-patients (50%, including 2 studies specifically on in-patients with first-episode disorder) and 5 on out-patients (15%). Twenty-nine of the included studies used ECG (85%) and 3 used photoplethysmography (9%) to measure HRV. In 28 studies (82%) assessment was short-term whereas in 4 (12%) assessment was considered as long-term (i.e. more than 1 h). Of the 29 studies with information on high-frequency HRV, 6 studies provided the data as normalised power (18%). In 21 cases the reported units reflected absolute power or normalised in proportion to total frequency).

Main effects
High-frequency variability
The meta-analysis revealed a significant effect ($Z = 3.35, P = 0.0008$), indicating that individuals with schizophrenia ($n = 1353$) have lower high-frequency HRV compared with
healthy controls \((n = 1702); g = -0.98, 95\% CI –1.56 to –0.41; \(k = 29\). Tests for statistical heterogeneity revealed significance (Fig. 2), indicating a possible bias. Visual inspection of the funnel plot showed that the reported effect was mainly based on larger studies reporting a significant effect, whereas a few smaller and non-significant studies appeared to be lacking (Fig. 3). In secondary analyses to assess this possible bias, we evaluated the main effect excluding the most extreme SMDs (i.e. \(k = 26\)). Because the estimation of standard deviations from range or interquartile range is not recommended by the Cochrane guidelines, we also calculated the effect omitting the studies that lacked information on standard deviations and potentially included estimated means. Again, a significant effect of a similar size was evident \((Z = 2.9, P = 0.003; g = -0.93, 95\% CI –1.54 to –0.32; \(k = 26\)). The forest plots for these secondary analyses can be found in online Fig. DS1.

**RMSSD**

The meta-analysis with RMSSD as the dependent variable also revealed a significant effect \((Z = 6.18, P < 0.0001)\), indicating that individuals with schizophrenia \((n = 1016)\) have lower RMSSD compared with healthy controls \((n = 1469); g = -0.91, 95\% CI –1.19 to –0.67; \(k = 24\). For details of study data and SMDs see Fig. 4. Tests for statistical heterogeneity revealed strong evidence of possible bias (Fig. 4); again, visual inspection of the funnel plot suggested that the reported effect was mainly based on larger studies reporting a significant effect, whereas a few smaller and non-significant studies were missing (Fig. 5). In the secondary analyses to examine possible bias, we analysed the main effect excluding studies with extreme SMDs (i.e. \(k = 26\)). The meta-analysis still revealed a significant effect \((Z = 5.83, P < 0.0001; g = -0.69, 95\% CI –0.92 to –0.46; \(k = 22\)). We repeated the calculation excluding studies without reported standard deviations, and again found the significant effect indicating decreased vagal activity in schizophrenia was robust \((Z = 5.75, P < 0.0001; g = -0.90, 95\% CI –1.21 to –0.60; \(k = 21\)). The forest plots for these secondary analyses are provided in online Fig. DS2.

**Fig. 2** Meta-analysis of main effects: high-frequency domain heart rate variability. SMD, standardised mean difference.

**Fig. 3** Funnel plot of main effects: high-frequency domain heart rate variability. SE, standard error; SMD, standardised mean difference.
Meta-regressions and subgroup analyses

Analyses of study-level covariates showed no significant effect as a function of age, duration of illness or medication (Table 1). In a subgroup analysis we compared the effect of studies that investigated in-patients with those investigating out-patients (Table 2). Again, no difference was found, with both groups showing a significant effect of similar magnitude, indicating lower high-frequency HRV and RMSSD in both schizophrenia groups compared with controls. When comparing the chronic schizophrenia group with first-episode patients, a slightly different picture was revealed: for high-frequency HRV both groups showed a significant main effect; however, the effect for patients with chronic schizophrenia was large whereas the effect for first-episode patients was medium in size. In contrast, the effect for RMSSD was not significant for patients with chronic schizophrenia, but was significant for first-episode patients. It is important to note the relatively large SE for the group with chronic schizophrenia (Table 2). Analyses of methodological heterogeneity showed that all but one HRV measurement subgroup showed a significant effect. Thus, the schizophrenia group evidenced lower vagal activity than controls for both outcome variables regardless of the applied methods, with one exception: no significant effect was found when only studies of long-term recordings of RMSSD were analysed. Again, it is noteworthy that the SE was relatively large and the analysis was based on two studies (see Table 2 for all effects and estimated P-values).

Discussion

This meta-analysis is the first to summarise the existing research on HRV in schizophrenia. Including data collected in more than a thousand individuals with schizophrenia compared with an equally large healthy control group, we were able to provide strong evidence that vagal activity is significantly reduced in schizophrenia. This finding is further corroborated by the fact that we found a distinct but similar effect for two different measures of vagal activity: the RMSSD and high-frequency power. For each outcome the effect was large – for both indices in the same
### Table 1 Meta-regression of pre-defined variables of interest

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Covariate</th>
<th>High-frequency HRV</th>
<th>RMSSD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$k$</td>
<td>$\beta$ (95% CI)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age of schizophrenia group</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>0.032 (−0.016, 0.08)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duration of illness</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>0.055 (−0.025, 0.135)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medication</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes (reference)</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>−0.953 (−1.482, −0.428)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>−0.035 (−0.830, 0.759)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

HRV, heart rate variability; RMSSD, root mean square of successive R–R-interval differences; SE, standard error.

### Table 2 Subgroup analyses of pre-defined variables of interest

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Setting</th>
<th>High-frequency HRV</th>
<th>RMSSD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$k$</td>
<td>$\beta$ (95% CI)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-patients</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>−0.669 (−1.274, −0.065)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Out-patients</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>−0.993 (−1.448, −0.538)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disorder</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chronic schizophrenia</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>−1.418 (−2.411, −0.424)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First episode</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>−0.500 (−0.922, −0.077)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recording duration</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short-term (&lt;1 h)</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>−1.023 (−1.508, −0.538)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long-term (&gt;3 h)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>−0.843 (−1.132, −0.553)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Method</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Photoplethysmography</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>−1.021 (−1.917, −0.125)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECG</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>−1.119 (−1.489, −0.749)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reported values</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Absolute</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>−0.847 (−1.306, −0.389)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Normalised</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>−0.789 (−1.266, −0.313)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ECG, electrocardiogram; HRV, heart rate variability; RMSSD, root mean square of successive R–R-interval differences; SE, standard error.

Our findings have a wide range of important implications. Reduced HRV may be considered as an endophenotype that is independently associated with executive dysfunction, difficulties in emotion regulation and disinhibition in schizophrenia. In line with the propositions by the model of neurovisceral integration, low cardiac vagal tone is an index of impaired central–peripheral neural feedback mechanisms that leads to a lack of psychophysiological resources when an individual is confronted with environmental challenges. Threat circuits that integrate internal and external context may be disinhibited, leading to a constant perception of threat and thus fear and arousal. Notably, recent data have provided the first evidence of an association of high resting HRV with enhanced safety learning and fear extinction.

**Limitations**

Our results need to be regarded in the light of the study’s limitations. First, a large number of studies had to be excluded...
Because of insufficient data and a lack of response by contacted authors, this holds potential bias for the effect size reported. However, all excluded studies reported lower vagal activity for the schizophrenia groups compared with healthy control groups, so their inclusion would not have changed the direction of the findings. Nevertheless, visual analysis of the funnel plots revealed a possible publication bias, with a lack of small studies showing an effect favouring lower vagal activity in individuals with schizophrenia. Thus, an overestimation of the effect is possible.

Adding to this, the number of studies included in the meta-analysis was not large enough for some meta-regressions and thus the risk of bias needs to be explored further. Finally, the relation to subgroup characteristics was investigated across trials and not within trials, which may have led to ecological bias. Accordingly, we can only conclude that these variables did not play a role at study level, whereas the within-study association was not investigated in this meta-analysis and should be considered in future studies.

Future research

Future research should further investigate the impact of reduced vagal activity on symptoms and information processing in schizophrenia. In particular, the association of HRV, threat processing and anxiety seems a promising research target, given that HRV is reduced in anxiety disorders, and in depression with comorbid anxiety to a larger extent than in depression alone. In the light of specificity, our results allude to a large effect in schizophrenia, whereas previous meta-analyses suggested small effects. This may be of interest, as cognitive–behavioural treatments have been found to enhance HRV in depression. However, direct comparisons are needed as existing studies across different disorders are rare and inconclusive. Furthermore, longitudinal designs in schizophrenia research are needed to test the predictive value of HRV for symptom development from non-clinical or prodromal stages. Also, the impact for therapeutic outcome may be of interest, as cognitive–behavioural treatments have been found to enhance HRV in depression.

To conclude, vagal activity is significantly reduced in patients with schizophrenia. Given its potential to indicate central–peripheral integration and the close association with schizophrenia-relevant brain regions, to threat processing, emotion regulation and executive functioning, HRV seems to be a promising endophenotype for schizophrenia research.

References


Resting vagal activity in schizophrenia: meta-analysis of heart rate variability as a potential endophenotype
Annika Clamor, Tania M. Lincoln, Julian F. Thayer and Julian Koenig
BJP 2016, 208:9-16.
Access the most recent version at DOI: 10.1192/bjp.bp.114.160762

References
This article cites 60 articles, 2 of which you can access for free at:
http://bjp.rcpsych.org/content/208/1/9#BIBL

Reprints/permissions
To obtain reprints or permission to reproduce material from this paper, please write to permissions@rcpsych.ac.uk

You can respond to this article at
/letters/submit/bjprcpsych;208/1/9

Downloaded from
http://bjp.rcpsych.org/ on October 14, 2017
Published by The Royal College of Psychiatrists

To subscribe to The British Journal of Psychiatry go to:
http://bjp.rcpsych.org/site/subscriptions/